

The Royal College of Organists.
CHURCH-MUSIC SOCIETY
OCCASIONAL PAPERS
No. 13

FORTY YEARS OF
CATHEDRAL MUSIC
1898-1938

A COMPARISON OF THE REPERTORIES OF
SERVICE MUSIC AND ANTHEMS IN REGULAR USE
IN THIRTY-FOUR CATHEDRALS AND COLLEGIATE
CHURCHES OF ENGLAND AND WALES AT
THESE DATES

Price 6d.

LONDON
SOCIETY FOR PROMOTING CHRISTIAN KNOWLEDGE
NORTHUMBERLAND AVENUE, W.C. 2
and
HUMPHREY MILFORD
OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS, AMEN HOUSE, E.C. 4

1940

FORTY YEARS OF CATHEDRAL MUSIC
1898-1938

I.—THE NATURE OF THE CASE

IN the last decade of the nineteenth century some of the younger cathedral organists and at least one cathedral precentor became imbued with a spirit of divine discontent. The repertory of music in daily use in the cathedrals of Great Britain was the cause. They found the weaker product of the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries perpetuated as part of an unquestioned routine. The generation immediately preceding theirs had been one of considerable vigour. Sir John Stainer, who succeeded Sir John Goss as organist of St. Paul's Cathedral in 1872, had been the spearhead in a reform of the conduct of cathedral worship which had had a widespread influence. If the shabbiness of cathedrals and the perfunctoriness of their choral establishments were giving way to a better order of things, that, in so far as the music was concerned, was largely due to such men as Sir Frederick Ouseley and his pupil John Stainer, who had been the first organist of Ouseley's College of Church Music, St. Michael's, Tenbury. But Ouseley, Stainer, and other less gifted men of their period, were also very prolific composers, and theirs was an age of cheap music printing. The younger spirits of the eighteen-nineties realized that the older and finer tradition of cathedral music had become swamped, first by the eighteenth century, then by the compositions of their immediate predecessors; that neither were judged on their merits, and that the latter more particularly were accepted on the strength of the personal reputations of their composers, and because they were made generally accessible by the convenient octavo editions of Messrs. Novello.

A group of these young men got together in an informal committee and determined on a serious effort to sift the

First published 1940

wheat from the chaff. They were hampered, however, as all such efforts are, by the invidiousness of expressing adverse opinions about the works of highly honoured musicians still living, some of whom were their own masters or elder colleagues. A minute of their deliberations has survived which contains a resolution to exclude the works of living composers from consideration; but that was to burke the major part of the problem. Actually they were not in a position to begin sifting until they had collected together the material to be sifted. The most practical outcome of their discontent was a Catalogue, the first of its kind, of services and anthems in actual use in fifty cathedrals and collegiate churches of the United Kingdom. Dr. (now Sir) Percy Buck, then organist of Wells, and the Rev. (now Doctor) E. H. Fellowes, then Minor Canon and Precentor of Bristol, were the two executive officers of this undertaking. The manuscript volume which records the results is all in the neat and scholarly hand of the latter. The title-page bears the following rather tendentious inscription:

A CATALOGUE OF CATHEDRAL MUSIC

COMPILED BY

E. H. FELLOWES AND P. C. BUCK

1898

Compiled with the object of showing that the music in present use at the chief Cathedrals and Collegiate Chapels of the United Kingdom does not properly represent the best work of the greatest English Church composers, much being omitted that should form the basis of every Cathedral repertoire, while much is included that is of the most trivial merit.

Forty years passed, and whatever the Catalogue had shown, it was still unknown to anyone but the compilers, when Dr. E. H. Fellowes brought the volume to a committee meeting of the Church-Music Society and placed it at the Society's disposal. The possession of such a record at

once suggested a similar enquiry into present-day conditions, leading to a comparative study of then and now. None of the eminent church composers of 1898 are now living. How far would it be found that time itself had done the sifting which the young men of the eighteen-nineties were unable to accomplish?

It is the primary object of this Paper to answer that question, but we wish to be less tendentious about it than the young enthusiasts of 1898 could afford to be. The enquiry set on foot with the co-operation of the Cathedral Organists' Association in 1938 started from no *a priori* line of reasoning. It was not designed to show either progress or retrogression; and even now, when the two have been carefully compared, it is not possible to sum up the many changes in a single word. It will be better to be content to describe the present state of things and to show wherein it differs from that of a generation ago, leaving the reader to cast the profit and loss account for himself.

The Basis of Comparison

The two catalogues are naturally not completely parallel. In 1898 the field covered was all the English cathedrals, with most of the collegiate churches and chapels which maintained musical daily services throughout the year or during term, the cathedrals of Ireland and Wales, and one (St. Mary's, Edinburgh) of Scotland. These together numbered fifty.

In 1938 the survey was narrower. It was confined to English cathedrals, excluding most of those in the newly formed dioceses which had not had the opportunity of forming regular musical establishments for daily choral services. The total was thirty-seven. Of these, three were not included in the 1898 survey—Birmingham Cathedral, St. George's, Windsor, and St. Nicolas College, Chislehurst. Birmingham did not exist as a diocese and St. Nicolas College did not exist at all in 1898. The omission of St. George's, Windsor, at that time was due to the personal wish of Sir Walter Parratt.

The common ground, therefore, of the two surveys is thirty-four English cathedrals and collegiate churches, and where comparative figures are given in the discussion below they will be based on the returns from those thirty-four establishments.¹ Thus, "Stanford in B flat (33.34)" implies that already in 1898 that service was very widely used, and that now it can be called universal; the actual figures were forty-two out of fifty in 1898 and thirty-seven out of thirty-seven in 1938. Recently there has been in clerical (not musical) circles what may be called a tentative revolt against Stanford in B flat. Those who do not like it, or who consider it "not good church music", whatever its intrinsic worth may be, had better realize its universality as a fact before they begin to tilt against it. They may be right, but they have the experience of more than half a century to refute. It will be fair to consider that any work which is sung in ten out of the thirty-four cathedrals is firmly rooted in the cathedral repertory, at any rate for the time being. Works given in less than five can hardly be said to be rooted at all. A new work will rightly be tried out at a few cathedrals, particularly when the composer is one well known to a number of cathedral organists or precentors. One cannot predict its future from such a list as this, but one that has got into the service lists of ten or more cathedrals has at least received a public welcome; we may conclude that it has come to stay and must be reckoned with as a factor in the music of the present generation. Therefore our principal concern here in regard to new music will be with works, services or anthems, which have already got that far.

Contrariwise, when a work in wide general use in 1898 has dropped by 1938 to less than ten cathedrals, we may suppose that it is dying out of the repertory. The most striking case of this is Barnby's Evening Service in E; widely admired and sung in thirty-eight out of the fifty cathedrals of the 1898 Catalogue, it now apparently only survives at Ripon. Thirty-two of Barnby's anthems had

¹ Where single figures only are given they are counted from the total (37) of the 1938 enquiry. (See p. 29.)

some currency in 1898, and some of them were then very popular. In 1938 only eight had to be listed, and only the one which formerly was the most popular, "It is high time", was found in as many as six cathedrals. That means that Barnby's church music is all practically dead. Its vogue is over, and the pundits who have for so long testified against it need do so no more. Time has done its work.

II.—MUSIC FOR THE HOLY COMMUNION

Sung celebrations on Sundays had been increasing in Anglican cathedrals since the eighteen-seventies, when Stainer had determined the musical use of St. Paul's. By the eighteen-nineties they were fairly frequent, but their music was not listed in 1898 because it was practically all by the then modern composers.¹

By 1938 every English cathedral save one (Liverpool) had adopted the principle of singing the Communion on at least one Sunday in the month, and in nineteen of them it was sung weekly.² This increased prevalence therefore called for a special section in the 1938 Catalogue devoted to settings of the Holy Communion Office.

No less than 131 settings are included. Three Masses (English versions) of William Byrd are found in the list, and other revivals from the Tudor period include Merbecke, Patrick in G minor (as completed by Ivor Atkins and A. E. Brent Smith), Royle Shore's adaptation from Causton, another adaptation described as "Tallis in D mi.", and Taverner's "Western Wynde" Mass, the last-named sung in only one cathedral (Southwark). A few cathedrals sing Palestrina, and the Mass "Æterna Christi Munera" may be said to have attained popularity, since it is sung in twelve

¹ Between the Elizabethan era and the nineteenth century the common practice was to set only responses to the Commandments (Kyrie) and the Nicene Creed. Only in a few isolated instances did composers also set *Sanctus* and *Gloria in excelsis*.

² See Church-Music Society's Occasional Paper No. 11, "The Present State of Cathedral Music", published in 1934. A revise of this (not published) was made in 1940.

out of the thirty-seven churches listed (St. Nicolas College is one of the number). There are occasional other foreign importations; two of Schubert's Masses and Mozart's in B flat, for example, are in the repertory of St. Paul's. But the vast majority of the 131 (something well over 100) are by English composers from the Victorian era to the present day. That probably means that time has got a lot of sifting to do here before the cathedral repertory of music for the Communion can be worthy of its high function.

Nevertheless, a list of the most used settings will suggest that the selective principle is at work. It is as follows:

Stanford in B flat (29)
 Stanford in C (25)
 Merbecke (25)
 Harwood in A flat (23)
 Wood, Charles (Phrygian) (21)
 Ireland in C (20)
 Wesley in E (16)
 Lloyd in E flat (16)
 Darke in F (15)
 Ley in E minor (13)
 Palestrina (*Æt. Xti. mun.*) (12)
 Stanford in A (12)
 Stanford in G (9)
 Smart in F (9)
 Harwood in D (9)
 Whitlock in G (9)
 Byrd 4 voc. (8)
 Byrd 5 voc. (7)
 Alcock in B flat (7)
 Macpherson in G (7)
 Garrett in D (7)
 Nicholson in D flat (6)
 Causton (adapted) (5)
 Stanford in F (5)
 Wood in C minor (5)
 Brewer in E flat (5)

This list approximates very closely to that of recommended works published by the Church-Music Society in

1930,¹ and though the names of Smart, Garrett, and Brewer are not to be found there, it can be said that there is not much grounds for controversy about the Communion Services now in general use in English cathedrals.

The others (107 in all) have currency in less than five, many of them in only one cathedral. It is amongst these that there must be need for the sifting process. Cathedral choirs who sing the Communion only once a month can require only a very small repertory, and might be expected to pick out a few fine settings and repeat them. Yet we do not always find that their repertories are smaller than those of cathedrals who sing Communion every Sunday and on Festivals and Red-Letter Saints' Days as well. Ripon, for example, where the Communion is sung once a month, has no less than twenty-five settings in use. St. Paul's Cathedral and York Minster have twenty-seven and thirty respectively, with something like five times as many occasions to provide for.

We may end this part of the discussion with a note of surprise that, despite the wide acceptance of Charles Wood's "Phrygian" Communion Service, his other settings have made so little headway. His Service in F is sung only at King's, Cambridge, and his "Ionian" Service only at Chichester.

III.—CANTICLES OF MORNING AND EVENING PRAYER

Here it is possible to make direct comparison between the Catalogues of 1898 and 1938. It must be remembered that whereas in cathedrals and collegiate churches and chapels the daily singing of Morning and Evening Prayer on Sundays and weekdays was the rule in 1898, by 1938 it had become the exception.² On Sundays the full choral Mattins

¹ "A Repertoire of Cathedral Music," compiled at the request of the Annual Conference of Cathedral Organists by Edmund H. Fellowes and C. Hylton Stewart. Published by the Church-Music Society. 18.

² See "Present State" (p. 7, n. 2, *supra*).

now tends to be crowded out by the Sung Communion. In the majority of cathedrals Mattins is now only sung on two or three days in the week, and then often in a drastically shortened form. As far as the music is concerned, it might in many cases just as well not be sung at all, for cathedral dignitaries are so busy with what may be called extramural work that they cannot often spare the time to remain in their stalls while the choir sings *Te Deum* and *Benedictus*. Often one canticle will be chanted, and the larger settings of *Te Deum* in which our forefathers took so just a pride are ruled out on score of time. A fuller Sung Evensong is still the general rule. It is easier to bring the boys from their schools and the lay clerks from their secular employments, and the clergy have a little more leisure to spare for it. There may be shortenings (e.g., one psalm instead of three), but *Magnificat* and *Nunc Dimittis* are generally sung to one musical setting.

The census of 1934¹ showed that the average number of sung weekday services in the thirty-four cathedrals and collegiate churches of the 1938 Catalogue was eight per week. That means that the repertory of canticles required (exclusive of Sundays) is two-thirds of that required in 1898. This would be to the good if the third which had been dropped were the rubbish which the compilers of 1898 deplored; but in the case of morning canticles that will not be quite the case, because of the time factor, which tends to eliminate the big works and retain the little ones. Unfortunately, neither Catalogue shows what parts of a service containing both morning and evening canticles are in use. For example, Gibbons in F (29.31) shows that that classic of purely English church music fully retains its place, but does not distinguish between the use of the morning and the evening canticles. Many out of the thirty-one can have only rare opportunities of singing its morning canticles.

In 1898 the number of settings of canticles listed as sung in cathedrals was 459; in 1938, with fewer sung services but many new works added, the number was 468. This looks

¹ "Present State." The revision of 1940 showed the average to have dropped further since the outbreak of war to 7.5.

as though there are still many which would never be missed if they were eliminated altogether.¹

No precise classification of over 450 works can be attempted here, but something may be done to show the changes in the taste by dividing the chief services common to both lists into (a) those which have held their ground through the last forty years, (b) those which have decreased in favour but still find a substantial place in cathedrals, and (c) those which are definitely outmoded. The pairs of figures in brackets represent 1898 and 1938. They may be described as (a) the perennials, (b) the survivors, (c) the defunct.

- (a) *The Perennials*.—Aldrich in G (27.21), Arnold in A (32.29), Boyce in A (33.23), Boyce in C (29.25), Cooke in G (32.29), Croft (with Elvey) in A (32.23), Gibbons in F (29.31), Goss in E (31.28), Kelway in B mi. (17.24), Kempton in B flat (23.21), Lloyd in E flat (18.30), Parry in D (21.24), Rogers in D (18.22), Smart in F (33.25), Stanford in B flat (30.34), Tallis in D mi. (22.28), Travers in F (26.22), Walmisley in D (24.24), Walmisley in D mi. (26.33), Wesley in E (16.26), Wesley in F (26.29).

Amongst this list of twenty-one there are several which have considerably increased their suffrages in the forty years. Definite revivals of forgotten or partially forgotten works will be considered later.

- (b) *The Survivors*.—Attwood in F (24.7), Calkin in B flat (26.6), Garrett in D (33.21), Garrett in E (20.10), Garrett in E flat (23.13), Gladstone in F (27.14), Goss in A (27.12), Hopkins in C (13.8), Hopkins in F (29.17), Kelway in A mi. (17.8), Mendelssohn in A (22.6), Nares in F (29.15), Smart in G (23.15), Stainer in A (22.9), Stainer in B flat (19.6), Stainer in E flat (30.14), Turle in D (29.14).

¹ Allowance must be made for the probability that in 1938 some of the older cathedral organists included in their returns services of which the choirs possess copies and which have been sung within their own memories, but have practically fallen into disuse.

Of these, Garrett in D might have been numbered with the perennials, but its loss of twelve cathedrals, taken in conjunction with the decline in his other works, indicates that it has lost caste.

When a work falls from double figures to three or less it may safely be placed in the third list. Instances are numerous. The following are those by well-known musicians:

- (c) *The Defunct*.¹—Barnby in E (29.1), Bridge in G (21.3), Calkin in D (9.1), Dykes in F (26.0), Ebdon in C (10.1), Elvey in F (13.1), Gadsby in C (14.0), Novello in E (11.3), Prout in F (12.1), Sullivan in D (16.3), Tours in F (22.3).

Most of the works in (b) and (c) are fairly old. They range from the eighteenth century to the middle of the nineteenth. It is unlikely that any will be revived, because they have been submitted to the most searching test of practical experience; they have served their turn and been replaced by newer work. The same thing will probably happen to much of the music of our contemporaries.

Here is a short list of services by modern composers which were beginning their vogue in 1898 and which have greatly increased it since:

- Gray in A (2.15), Harwood in A flat (10.33), Noble in B mi. (1.31), Stanford in A (14.31), Wood in E flat, No. 1 (3.25).

When we come to consider services composed since 1898, it must be remembered that one which is only sung in a single cathedral, perhaps that of which the composer is organist, may forty years hence be just as important as those which are everywhere performed now. The above list affords two excellent examples. In 1898 Noble in B minor was sung only in the composer's own cathedral, York Minster; now it is heard practically everywhere. Again, Charles Wood's first Service in E flat was in 1898 known only to the college choirs of Cambridge; to-day not only that composition

¹ Three services by Ch. Gounod which had found their way into a few cathedrals in 1898 had disappeared before 1938.

but the many which followed it have made the name of Charles Wood one of the most highly honoured of modern English Church composers. So one notes certain names of young composers in the 1938 Catalogue whose music is little known at present, but who may be the successors in the long line which stretches from the sixteenth century to the present day. It would be unwise to attempt to name them, and prophecy is not our business.

We may, however, give a list of some of the new works which have gained their places, on the lines of that given for the Communion Services, but exclusive of revivals from the past. It is not carried below the double numbers, which refer to the thirty-seven cathedrals listed in 1938.

- Stanford in C (36), Ireland in F (32), Gray in G (21), Nicholson in D flat (21), Alcock in B flat (20), Walford Davies in G (18), Dyson in D (17), Bairstow in D (15), Gray in F mi. (15), Wood in E flat, No. 2 (14), Wood in G (14), Wood in F (13), Brewer in E flat (13), Bullock in D (11), Walford Davies in C (11), Harwood in E mi. (11), Gray in B flat (10), Brewer in D (10), Cook (E.T.) in G (10).

Our period of forty years has included a remarkable revival of public interest in the polyphonic music of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, both sacred and secular, stimulated in the case of church music by the Carnegie Trust's ten folio volumes of Tudor Church Music and the accompanying octavo edition issued by the Oxford University Press. It is natural, therefore, to enquire what effect these and similar publications have had on cathedral repertories, and it appears, as far as settings of the canticles are concerned, to be rather small.

The 1898 Catalogue was compiled according to historical periods, the first of which, "Early English to 1625", contained ten services. Of these, only three (Farrant, Gibbons, and Tallis) could be said to have general currency, while Byrd's Short Service and Patrick in G minor were given in less than ten places.

The 1938 Catalogue shows a certain increase, but hardly

one commensurate with the widespread revival of "Tudor" music in the world at large. The following is an alphabetical list of its contents:

Batten in D mi. (2), Bevin in D mi. (14), Byrd, Great Service (3), Byrd, Short Service (31), Byrd, Second Service (Evening) (11), Byrd, Third Service (Evening) (15), Causton, Short Service (20), John Farrant (11), Richard Farrant in A mi. (35), Fayrfax, Modal (edited by Royle Shore) (3), Gibbons in F (34), Gibbons in D mi. (transposed) (7), Morley in D mi. (trans.) (1), Mundy, Short Service (2), Parsley in G mi. (trans.) (1), Patrick in G mi. (25), Tallis in D mi. (trans.) (30), Tallis 5 voc. (1), Tomkins in C (6), Tomkins in D (1), Tomkins in E flat (2), Tomkins in F (1), Tomkins in F mi. (3), Tye in G mi. (identical with Parsley) (3), Weelkes, Short Service (10), Weelkes for two trebles (1).

To these are added certain adaptations and arrangements as *Faux Bourdons*.

The upshot seems to be that William Byrd alone has received something like a thorough revival, and that most of those whose work was unknown in 1898 still have only a precarious foothold in our cathedral service lists.

But the position of the Tudor composers can probably be more truly assessed in relation to Anthems, which we must now consider.

IV.—ANTHEMS

What is an anthem? The compilers of the Prayer Book (1662), who inserted the rubric "In Quires and Places where they sing here followeth the Anthem" after the third Collect of Morning and Evening Prayer, had behind them more than a hundred years' experience of the English anthem from which to make a definition had they been called on for one. But definition was not then needed.

An anthem meant for them a piece of free musical composition for voices (solo and/or chorus), with or without instrumental accompaniment, based on a text taken from

Holy Scripture or from the Liturgy of the Church (*e.g.*, the Collects), or from metrical versions of the Psalms.

These texts were chosen by the composer at will, but later composers began to group texts from several sources into one anthem without regard to any liturgical association.¹ With the influx of hymns in the nineteenth century a new source of anthem texts was offered, and composers frequently combined verses of hymns with Biblical texts—*e.g.*, Stainer's "I saw the Lord".² Later, again, composers have used still more freedom, going to secular poetry for their anthem texts, so that it not infrequently happens to-day that compositions are sung as anthems whose words have no direct bearing on the worship of the Church and in some cases are even at variance with the teaching of the Christian religion. Such words, though they may be fine and inspiring poetry, have no proper place in the liturgical services of the Church. They may, if their music warrants it, be admissible in the programmes of musical recitals in a church, but that is quite another matter. They are not anthems in the sense of the rubric.

Hubert Parry, to take one salient example, had no intention of offering Lockhart's "There is an old belief" to be sung as a church anthem, when he chose it as one of his noble "Six Songs of Farewell". Some of the six, "Never weather-beaten sail" (Campion) and "My soul, there is a country" (Vaughan), may qualify in the repertory as christian hymns, but a poem which suggests that the

¹ Purcell generally confined himself to a psalm (the whole or selected verses) or a connected passage of Scripture. Sometimes he grouped into one anthem texts from several sources when writing for special occasions—*e.g.*, "My heart is inditing" for the Coronation of James II. The example of Handel's *Messiah* increased the practice of grouping in the eighteenth century. S. S. Wesley, incomparably the greatest anthem-writer of the nineteenth century, sometimes combined texts from different parts of the Bible so closely as to make the anthem a meditation on a devotional idea. "Thou wilt keep him in perfect peace," for example, is made up of half-verses from Isaiah xxvi. 3, Psalm cxxxix. 11, 1 John i. 5, Psalm cxix. 175, Matthew vi. 13 (the Lord's Prayer), with a repetition of Isaiah xxvi. 3 as a refrain.

² J. S. Bach's treatment of the Lutheran Chorale has had a wide latter-day influence on English composers in this matter.

resurrection of the dead is an "old belief" to which sentiment clings piteously cannot be called christian, though Parry's music speaks with the tongues of men and of angels.

Another factor which has confused the issue is the prevalent use of excerpts from oratorios as cathedral anthems. This began with Handel's *Messiah*,¹ and went on in turn to Mendelssohn's *Elijah*, Spohr's *Last Judgement*, Bach's *Passions* and *Christmas Oratorio*, Brahms's *German Requiem* and other masterpieces of this kind.

There is justification for this use of *Messiah* in the fact that the words are taken direct from the Authorized Version of the Bible. There is less for those which are translations from the Lutheran Bible (made to fit the music and therefore not always the best English), and there is a positive objection to the use of those excerpts from Bach which are based on the versification of the second-rate poetasters who provided librettos for his church cantatas.

Our cathedrals are the historic repositories of the English language, at its finest in the Bible and the Prayer Book. Their services are designed to show forth the Christian Faith in the terms of that language. The anthems authorized as a part of those services must be in consonance with the rest of the liturgy both as regards the Faith and its expression in language.

If this standard is to be maintained, we must cheerfully banish from cathedral service lists a great deal of fine music, some of it the greatest ever written. That is no hardship because nowadays Deans and Chapters are very ready to open the cathedrals to special musical performances; oratorios are given as wholes with or without orchestra; miscellaneous choral music is included in recitals of all kinds. Those are the right occasions for Bach and Brahms, for then the music is the one absorbing interest. Foreign compositions are rarely quite appropriate to the Choir

¹ It was Theodore Aylward (1730-1801) who began the practice at St. George's Chapel, Windsor, where he became organist and master of the choristers in 1788—that is, a few years after the Commemoration of Handel in Westminster Abbey, of which he had been, as Burney says, a "subdirector".

Offices, both because of their words and because the style of the music is apt to be out of accord with its surroundings.¹

Another factor to be reckoned with is the use of the Latin language for anthems. This was not thought of, except, possibly, in a few college chapels, in 1898. It is commonly permitted in cathedrals to-day. To sing a motet in Latin will often evade the evils of a bad English translation. Let us have, if we must, Haydn's "Insanæ et vanæ curæ" rather than suffer "Distracted with care and anguish". The practice has brought distinct benefits, and particularly has helped forward the revival of the old English music, originally written for the Latin Liturgy. No sane critic would oppose the discreet use of Latin anthems, though they share to some extent with foreign translated works the suggestion of incongruity.

The vast mass of works of all these and other different kinds included as anthems in the 1938 Catalogue defies classification. All that can be attempted here is a few notes on those composers who have been distinguished as writers of the genuine English anthem. Comparison of the two Catalogues will do something to show how the older among them have increased or decreased in favour during the last forty years. Their names are arranged below alphabetically, and only those are included who have gained currency to the extent of ten cathedrals for at least one substantial work either in 1898 or 1938. Therefore, if the name of a well-known anthem-writer is missing, it may be concluded that his work has never been widely accepted in the cathedral service, though it may have been deservedly popular elsewhere. The comparative figures are on the same plan as those given to services.

Aldrich, Henry (1647-1710). Three of Aldrich's anthems were still popular in 1898. Now only one, "Out of the deep" (19.11), can be said to be in general use.

¹ There is something to be said for occasional use of oratorio extracts as anthems in provincial cathedrals when complete performances of the oratorios are out of the question. They should be chosen with due regard for the Church seasons, and are best given on Sundays and those festival days when the music is intended for the people.

Armes, Philip (1836-1908). Twenty-eight anthems were listed in 1898, of which only one, "Give ear" (21.12), was widely given. Many of the others were given only at Durham, and only four of them are mentioned in 1938.

Attwood, Thomas (1765-1838). Twelve anthems were listed in 1898, of which six appear to have retained their popularity. They are, "Come, Holy Ghost" (26.20), "They that go down" (16.11), "Enter not into judgement" (17.20), "Teach me, O Lord" (22.20), "Turn Thee again" (20.18), and "Turn Thy face" (28.21).

Bairstow, Edward (1874-). Sir Edward Bairstow has made a substantial contribution to the repertory of modern anthems. Twenty-one are listed in 1938, four may be described as in general use in cathedrals, while several others are found in five or six. "Save us, O Lord" (29) is the most widely used. The others are not named here, since it is not the intention of this summary to encourage a uniform choice. It is quite possible that, as was said of services, some of Bairstow's anthems at present only heard at York may become general favourites in the near future.

Barnby, Joseph (1838-1896). Thirty-two anthems were listed in 1898, of which only eight survived to 1938. None of these is sung in more than six cathedrals to-day, but Lichfield still keeps Barnby's flag flying with five of his anthems in its repertory.

Batten, Adrian (-1637). Six anthems were in somewhat sporadic use in 1898, of which "Deliver us" (14.19) was, as now, the most popular. Nine are included in 1938, and one more, "O praise the Lord" (8.12), qualifies for mention here. The restudy and reissue of Batten's surviving compositions is still incomplete.

Battishill, Jonathan (1738-1801). Of the seven anthems listed in 1898, one, "Call to remembrance" (27.23), was by far the most generally used. One other, "O Lord, look down" (7.31), has substantially increased its popularity.

Bennett, W. Sterndale (1816-1875). "God is a Spirit" (26.22) and "O that I knew" (22.28) retain their popularity.

Blow, John (1648/9-1708). Twelve anthems were listed in 1898 and sixteen in 1938. The issue of octavo editions has brought some slight revival of interest in Blow's work, but not with any far-reaching effect on cathedrals. The Latin motet "Salvator Mundi" (13) is the only acquisition widely performed.

Boyce, William (1710-1779). Thirty of Boyce's anthems were listed in 1898 and twenty-six in 1938. The most used a generation ago still keep their popularity now, with "O where shall wisdom be found?" (29.30) at their head. A comparison of the numbers throughout shows that Boyce's position is singularly little changed.

Bullock, Ernest (1890-). Dr. Bullock has addressed himself to anthem composition with unusual assiduity. Seventeen of his works are now in cathedral repertories, and two of them, "Give us the wings of faith" (16) and "O most merciful" (16), are in wide general use. This suggests the desirability of hearing those which at present have been given only at Westminster Abbey.

Byrd, William (1542/3-1623). The fifty-nine compositions, English and Latin, listed as anthems in 1938, are at least a substantial recognition of the supremacy of William Byrd in English Church music. The distribution shows that there is not a cathedral or collegiate church in all the thirty-seven which does not pay a modicum of homage to his genius. In many cases, however, it is still a very small modicum, and when it is considered that the average number of services where anthems are sung is between 400 and 500 per annum in each of the thirty-seven, it is evident that the resources of this prolific composer have not yet been plumbed. As a matter of fact, only a few of the long-familiar English anthems, such as "Bow thine ear" and "Sing joyfully", with one or two Latin motets, "Justorum animæ" and "Ave verum corpus", are in anything like general use. Actual numbers have no particular significance. The broad fact is that

Byrd is at last beginning to come into his own in our cathedrals, though not to an extent commensurate with his recognition elsewhere as one of the world's great masters of music.¹

Clarke, Jeremiah (c. 1659-1707). Only one anthem retains its vogue, "I will love Thee, O Lord" (10).

Creyghton, Robert (1639-1733/4). The same is the case here, "I will arise" (26.29).

Croft, William (1687-1727). On the other hand, Croft retains some hold. Though thirty-three anthems by him were listed in 1898 and only eighteen in 1938, the most popular at the earlier date are still widely used at the later one.

Crotch, William (1775-1847). Similarly with Crotch; of the sixteen anthems listed in 1898, twelve are found in 1938. Three of them are in wider use than formerly—"Comfort, O Lord" (22.24), "How dear are Thy counsels" (28.33), and "Lo star-led chiefs" (*Palestine*) (23.27).

Dering, Richard (—1630). The motets, Latin and English, must be noticed as a definite addition to the modern repertory. Dering's name does not appear in 1898, but thirteen are listed in 1938 as a result of the research and publication which has intervened.

Elgar, Edward (1857-1934). A few original anthems as well as excerpts from oratorios have been welcomed. The most used are "Light of the World" (16), "O harken Thou" (14), "The Spirit of the Lord" (*The Apostles*) (10).

Elvey, George (1816-1893), has suffered eclipse. Thirty anthems were listed in 1898, and some of them were very widely used. Fifteen appear in 1938, but none of them reach to double numbers.

Farrant, Richard (1564-1580). "Call to remembrance" (27.31) and "Hide not Thou Thy face" (25.28) still keep his reputation green, although "Lord, for Thy tender mercies' sake" (33.31) has been reft from him to revivify that of John Hilton.

¹ Sir Henry Hadow used to say, "I shall not be satisfied till I hear Palestrina referred to as the Italian Byrd".

Gardiner, H. Balfour (1877-). "Thee, Lord, before the close of day" (*Te lucis*) (23) is much sung. It seems a case where the adoption of Latin is to be recommended.

Garrett, George (1834-1897). The sixteen anthems listed in 1898 show Garrett's popularity at its height. None of the few which survived to 1938 qualify for mention here.

Gibbons, Orlando (1583-1625). The position of Gibbons has not greatly changed. Nineteen anthems were listed in 1898 and twenty-six in 1938. Revival has been assisted by republication, but all the most popular now were already in the repertory forty years ago. The most noteworthy increases are "O Lord, increase my faith" (4.28) and "This is the record of John" (6.28).

Goss, John (1800-1880). Out of thirty-three anthems listed in 1898, only three appear to have dropped out of use, and most of those in general use then are so still. Comparative figures need not be given; Goss is clearly one of the perennials.

Gounod, Charles (1818-1893). Not so Gounod. Although a Frenchman, in 1898 he was considered one of the leading composers for the English Church, with thirty-three anthems to his name. Now only a dozen of them are to be heard in two or three cathedrals.

Gray, Alan (1855-1935). One out of several anthems produced since 1898 has gained wide currency, "What are these that glow from afar?" (19).

Greene, Maurice (1695-1755). Forty-eight anthems were listed in 1898, and those most used then retain their places in 1938. Greene appears as a counterpart of Goss in staying power, but he has had a century longer to stay.

Harris, William (1883-). One out of the dozen anthems listed in 1938 qualifies for mention here, "Faire is the heaven" (12). As in similar cases, it is named with the suggestion that there are others which may in a short time extend their vogue.

Harwood, Basil (1859-). Two early anthems were listed in 1898, and there are eight others in 1938.

Only one, however, has reached widespread use, "O how glorious" (30).

Hayes, William (1707-1777). Several anthems are still more or less current, notably "Great is the Lord" (26.12).

Hilton, John (-1657). See Farrant above.

Holst, Gustav (1874-1934). There are fourteen entries under Holst's name in 1938, but not all of them can properly be called anthems (e.g., "Terly Terlow"). Among them is "Turn back, O man" (10).

Hopkins, Edward J. (1818-1901). His once popular anthems have gone out of fashion. A typical case is "I will wash" (16.2).

Humfrey, Pelham (1647-1674). The work of Pelham Humfrey still awaits systematic research. Two of his anthems have slightly increased their vogue, "Hear, O Heaven" (5.8) and "Rejoice in the Lord" (13.13).¹

Ley, Henry (1887-). Two out of the sixteen anthems listed in 1938 are in general use, "Lo round the throne" (17) and "The strife is o'er" (14), a fact which prompts the same suggestion as is made above about Harris.

Macpherson, Charles (1870-1927). Of the twelve anthems listed in 1938, two require mention, "Awake, my soul" (14) and "Thou, O God" (10).

Mundy, William (-c. 1591). "O Lord, the Maker" (10.26), ascribed in 1898 to Henry VIII, shows that it has not lost its popularity along with its royal status.

Ouseley, Frederick Gore (1825-1889). Sir Frederick Ouseley, most prolific of anthem composers, had sixty-seven anthems listed in 1898. Many of them were sung only at Tenbury. Nevertheless, thirty-two remain in 1938, and the following are evidently still popular: "From the rising" (30.28) "How goodly" (28.27), "Is it nothing to you?" (9.10), "It came even to pass" (11.8), "O Saviour of the world" (3.16).

Parry, Hubert (1848-1918). Two anthems by Parry, together with "Blest Pair", were listed in 1898. In the longer list of 1938, which includes five of the six

¹ These are also sung at Windsor and Chislehurst.

Songs of Farewell, it is surprising to find how little from his several church cantatas has been adopted for anthems. Of the Songs of Farewell the most used is "My Soul, there is a country" (23). His most important genuine anthem is "I was glad" (23), composed for the Coronation of King Edward VII and used at the two subsequent coronations.

Philips, Peter (1580-1621). He is one of the Tudor composers who is not named in 1898. In spite of subsequent research, his music is only making a tentative appearance in cathedrals, with the exception of "The Lord ascendeth" (15).

Purcell, Henry (1658/9-1695). Both 1898 and 1938 give long lists of Purcell's anthems in use, but both, and especially the later list, show a shyness about the bigger works. This is natural, since those which are generally called the Chapel Royal anthems, written with elaborate verses for men's voices and with overtures and accompaniments for strings, are not feasible in normal cathedral conditions. They are more suitably reserved for special occasions than given with maimed rites, as was customary in the last century. The shorter works with organ, such as "Thy word is a lantern" (24.25) and "Rejoice in the Lord" (29.32), are in great request, and the Latin motet "Jehova quam multi" (12) is a valuable acquisition. It is surprising to find "With drooping wings" (the lovely but quite pagan finale to the opera *Dido and Æneas*) listed as an anthem sung in Liverpool Cathedral. It may be worth while also to note that "Soul of the world" from the Ode for St. Cecilia's Day is a hymn addressed to Music, not to the Almighty.

Redford, John (c. 1485-1585), survives in English cathedrals only in "Rejoice in the Lord alway" (8.20).

Roberts, J. Varley (1841-1920). Little remains now. The most popular in 1898 was "Seek ye the Lord" (14.2).

Rogers, Benjamin (1614-1698). Several anthems remain in the repertory. The most widely used now is "Teach me, O God" (26.15).

Stainer, John (1840-1901). Fifty-seven anthems were listed in 1898, and twenty-seven in 1938. At the former date Stainer was one of the most popular anthem composers in the cathedral repertoires. Now only one has any substantial place there, "I saw the Lord" (23.13), and, strange to say, it is not recorded in 1938 as given at St. Paul's, where he is now only represented by one other anthem.

Stanford, Charles Villiers (1852-1934). Only seven anthems were listed in 1898; thirty-nine are found in 1938. Comparative numbers, therefore, are not required. Those most used at the present day are "And I saw another Angel" (20), "Glorious and powerful God" (24), "How beauteous are the feet" (16), "If thou shalt confess" (12), "Justorum animæ" (13), "O for a closer walk" (20), "O living will" (11), "The Lord is my Shepherd" (30), "Ye choirs" (10).

Sullivan, Arthur (1842-1900). Thirty-two anthems were listed in 1898, and seventeen in 1938. His anthems have suffered a fate similar to that of Stainer's. But "O gladsome light" (*The Golden Legend*) (10), not listed in 1898, has gained currency as an anthem.

Tallis, Thomas (c. 1505-1585). The Tudor revival has brought in a number of the Latin motets to increase the repertory, as well as a few English anthems doubtfully ascribed to Tallis. The most widely used of the Latin works is "Salvator Mundi" (13), and "O Lord, give Thy Holy Spirit" (25), not found in 1898, has become popular.

Travers, John (1703-1758). "Ascribe unto the Lord" (24.15) holds its place.

Tye, Christopher (c. 1500-1572/3). Tye's anthems are sung in only a few cathedrals, with the exception of "O come, ye servants" (6.25), a revival probably aided by its inclusion as one of the Homage anthems at the Coronation of King George VI.

Walmisley, Thomas (1814-1856). Several anthems are still widely used—namely, "Father of Heaven" (18.17), "From all that dwell" (11.21), "Hear, O Thou

Shepherd" (18.16), "If the Lord Himself" (7.10), "Not unto us" (15.15), "Remember, O Lord" (8.12). Their figures show a remarkable constancy.

Weldon, John (1676-1736). Two anthems still hold a substantial position, "In Thee, O Lord" (28.17) and "O praise God" (16.12).

Wesley, Samuel (1766-1837). "In exitu Israel" (3.17) is the only anthem in general use.

Wesley, Samuel Sebastian (1810-1876). There is certainly no diminution in the ubiquitousness of S. S. Wesley's anthems. Both Catalogues contain long lists of them, from which it may be seen that all the most popular in 1898 kept their supremacy till 1938. There has been a tendency to use parts of the longer anthems instead of wholes in these less leisured days.

Whyte, Robert (c. 1530-1574). The Tudor revival has brought in a few works, Latin and English, of which "O praise God" (13) has received the widest acceptance.

Williams, R. Vaughan (1872-). The shorter festival works, notably the "Mystical Songs", have been drawn on to enrich the anthem lists. Of the several anthems proper, "Lord, Thou hast been our refuge" (13) is the one in widest circulation.

Wise, Michael (c. 1648-1687). Four anthems are still in general use, "Awake, awake" (18.15), "Awake up my glory" (22.14), "Prepare ye the way" (21.18), "The ways of Zion" (3.13). The increased currency of the last-named is noteworthy.

Wood, Charles (1866-1926). One anthem only was listed in 1898 as sung at Ely. It remains in the list of twenty-eight found in 1938, but has not become one of the most popular. If not quite as numerous as Stanford's, Wood's anthems have been recognized as an equally distinctive contribution. Those in wide general use now are "An Easter Carol" (12), "Glory and Honour" (21), "Great Lord of Lords" (10), "Hail, Gladdening Light" (23), "O Thou, the central orb" (20), "This sanctuary" (*Expectans, expectavi*) (26).

POSTSCRIPT

Our 400 years of cathedral music is conveniently classified in five historical periods, each of which makes some contribution to the modern repertory. It may help to clarify the situation if we apply that classification to the material before us.

- (1) What is usually but inaccurately called the "Tudor" period begins for our purpose with the issue of the first Prayer Book (1549) and extends into the seventeenth century up to the destruction of the cathedral establishments under the Protectorate of Cromwell, about 100 years.
- (2) The Restoration period is shorter. It was signalized by the restoration of the monarchy of Charles II, bringing the re-establishment of the Church and the reissue of the Book of Common Prayer (1662), which has provided the norm of the Anglican Offices ever since. It lasted through a long-lived generation—no more. It is defined musically by the life of John Blow (1648-1708).
- (3) The eighteenth century established a routine of cathedral worship, with its inherent evils and attendant benefits. Every cathedral organist composed services and anthems. The result was a type of music containing little genius but much practicability. It was decorous, efficient, and without adventure. Some examples of its music were more interesting than others, and the later composers of the century, who had felt the influence of Handel, showed the profit of it more in their anthems than in their services. Together they created a definite type which lasted into the first quarter of the nineteenth century.
- (4) Church life was stirred in the Victorian era by two great movements, Evangelical and Catholic. Each had its most immediate effect on parochial church services. The one gave the people hymns, the other adopted hymn-singing and later reintroduced the Sung Communion. The tardy acceptance of both in cathedrals began the process of reconstituting the cathedral service on the lines of the

parish church. Composers wrote music which could be used in both. They aimed at attractiveness rather than at the preservation of a traditional style.

- (5) It is too early to speak of a twentieth-century style, but some of the influences which have affected the century's first forty years can be discerned. There is first what is called "practical Christianity", the view that God is served less by acts of worship than by the promotion of human welfare. With this "Modernism" agrees, since it puts the sustenance of the spirit of man before Christian dogma. There is also an artistic Modernism which has emphasized "self-expression" as the artist's chief aim. Hence the eccentricity which we have noticed in the choice of words for anthems, and the tendency to bring in to the cathedrals whatever has been found serviceable in parish churches, mission halls, and even concert-rooms. If this tendency should proceed unchecked there will be no such thing as a cathedral style to be described when the very existence of the cathedral musical establishments is threatened and those who value them are called to their defence. It is not meant by this that the cathedrals have nothing to learn from the parish churches. They have already learnt much; but they stand for a higher type of musical culture. It is for them to know how to refuse the evil and to choose the good.

The present musical repertory contains fragments derived from all five periods. Those on whom the choice depends treat the first period as a quarry from which treasures of the past may be recovered. The second period is of less interest to them; it belongs too much to its own time to fit into other conditions. The long third period (eighteenth century) is still dominant in the daily offices of provincial cathedrals. Time has sifted it and left a considerable residuum of its music, which probably represents the best in its kind. The fourth period has been handled drastically, and much of what was most admired of its mid-Victorian product (Barnby, Stainer, Gounod,

Garrett) has been scrapped. This is probably partly the result of natural reaction, and present judgement on it may be too severe. But it must be remembered that what is cast out from cathedrals still finds a home in many a parish church. Stainer is by no means as dead as the 1938 Catalogue would suggest.

Of the fifth period little or nothing can be said beyond the fact that it represents tentative experiment. The most hopeful sign is that along with much else it already contains certain works by composers too little known who represent their own age with music which enlarges on the best traditions of the past. Among them, for example, are some composers whose cathedral music has been influenced to its benefit by the recovery of the "Tudor" polyphony.

Clearly the present repertory of cathedral music is not ideal. That in itself is a sign of life. We do not want it to be a museum of exquisite period pieces, logically arranged. What we want to see is the older work surviving because it has been proved to meet a need, and the new added to it for a like reason. The addition of the new must always mean the disuse of something older. We need not be afraid of that. A constant process of taking in new nourishment and shedding outworn tissue is as much a sign of health in art as it is in the human body.

But in the case of the cathedral service the musical rendering should remain consonant with the spirit of the Prayer Book so long as the Prayer Book is the accepted service book of the whole Anglican Communion. It is enjoined there that "the Psalter shall be read through once every month". Where singing takes the place of reading it is hardly consonant with that direction that one psalm should be sung and the others appointed for the day be left out. Three canticles are appointed to be "said or sung" at each Morning Prayer and two at each Evening Prayer. There was a time when *Venite* was sung to a setting, like the others. The practice was dropped, but the other two canticles of Mattins with the two of Evensong were recognized from the time of the Restoration to within living memory as proper to be sung to characteristic music—

that is, not merely anglican chants repeated verse by verse. A tradition of 300 years is not lightly to be broken.

The singing of an important anthem has been a feature of the cathedral service through the same period. Is the anthem to be reduced to a "figured chorale" of German origin or a trifling part-song of English origin in order to save five minutes? Surely no. While we still have our cathedral choirs, let their embellishment of the Prayer Book Offices be ample and generous. Let us at least maintain their musical contribution to worship at its highest until circumstances force us to relinquish it altogether.

LIST OF THE THIRTY-FOUR CATHEDRALS AND COLLEGIATE CHURCHES COMMON TO THE CATALOGUES OF 1898 AND 1938.

Bristol.	Manchester.
Cambridge (King's College).	Norwich.
" (St. John's College).	Oxford (Christ Church).
Canterbury.	" (Magdalen).
Carlisle.	" (New College).
Chester.	Peterborough.
Chichester.	Ripon.
Durham.	Rochester.
Ely.	Salisbury.
Eton.	Southwark.
Exeter.	Southwell.
Gloucester.	Tenbury (St. Michael's).
Hereford.	Wells.
Lichfield.	Westminster Abbey.
Lincoln.	Winchester.
Liverpool.	Worcester.
London (St. Paul's).	York Minster.

In 1938 only: Birmingham Cathedral, St George's Chapel (Windsor), St. Nicolas College (Chislehurst).